Women in Politics of Kyrgyzstan: Impact of Gender in Decision-Making Processes

By Kutbiddin kyzy Nazira

Supervisor: Munara Omuralieva

A thesis submitted to the International and Comparative Politics Department of American University of Central Asia in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of Arts.

May 2015
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. 3

Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 4
  - Background
  - Problem Setting
  - Research question
  - Hypothesis
  - Methodology

Chapter I:
1.1: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework .............................................................. 10

Chapter II:
2.1: Historical background of women in Kyrgyzstan ............................................................ 16

Sub chapters:
2.1: History of outstanding women in ancient Kyrgyz society .............................................. 17
2.2: Promotion of women in Soviet Period ......................................................................... 18
2.3: The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan after Soviet Period .................. 21
2.4: Dynamics of women’s political rights and activities in Kyrgyzstan .............................. 23

Chapter III:
3.1: How gender can impact the decision-making processes? ............................................ 34
3.2. Female leader- Roza Otunbaeva in Kyrgyzstan’s political arena .................................. 41

Conclusion ............................................................................................................................ 46

Bibliography ......................................................................................................................... 48
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my appreciation to my thesis supervisor, Omuralieva Munara for her guidance, assistance and motivation in writing my senior thesis. I express my deepest appreciation to Jomart Ormonbekov for our great discussions and for his recommendations. Also, I want to thank all professors of International and Comparative Department for knowledge, support and advices they gave me during my study in university. I want to thank my family who always support me and believe in me.
Introduction

In the last decades feminism started to play an important role in political life in the world. Women started to participate in all spheres of public life and changed the discourse of modern politics. The new “phenomenon” which was shown by women in political life is a kind of break of women for the top echelons of power. In countries as: Western Europe, South-East Asia and Latin America women have taken power into their hands.”\(^1\) The feminist movement brought a revolt which was caused by the development of self-consciousness of women who defend women’s interests, who can make a demand and of course make it to be heard. For the last decade the phenomenon of feminism becomes an ideology where women are on a par with men and that women also are able to take socially important responsibilities on themselves. People say that “women and politics” are two things which are incompatible”\(^2\), however, on the other hand, the tendency of women is growing. Meanwhile, the second half of the twentieth century is a period when under the influence of the development of science, technology, education, culture, and many other factors there is a rapid growth of intellectual potential of humanity when a social and spiritual emancipation of the individual becomes a necessary condition for the survival of mankind.\(^3\)

The hypothesis of this work will be about the contribution of first female president Roza Otunbaeva in Kyrgyzstan that she set the country on a democratic path and who could represent country’s interests abroad. She first actively supported the idea of involvement of women and young people in decision-making processes. The second part of the work will describe women who participate in decision-making processes, who promote gender mainstreaming and gender sensitivity in decision-making processes. The paper will describe the representation of women in political life from the historical establishment of Kyrgyz society till nowadays by their

---


\(^2\) Ibid

\(^3\) Novikova E.S. “Women in political life of Russia”, article, last modified April 25, 2015, http://www.a-z.ru/women/texts/novikovr.htm#.)
contribution and positive impact to the development of the state. Further it describes women’s promotion in political life in Soviet and contemporary periods. This work thoroughly describes women’s liberation from past time till nowadays, also it represents their rights and activities. The introduction part of this work is about the international laws on women’s rights, with descriptive statistics on the representation of women at the decision-making level in the Kyrgyzstan for 2014. The first chapter provides theoretical framework which explains the concept of “critical mass”. Also, authors who researched the theory of “critical mass” identified what might be gained or lost in women’s political representation. They focused on opportunities for women in order to strengthen women’s position in political sphere. Moreover, scholars explained opportunities for women in order to stabilize their position in political sites. The second chapter describes about the historical background of outstanding women in Kyrgyzstan especially who possessed political positions in ancient Kyrgyz society. Sub-chapter of the second chapter includes further development of women in political life in Soviet period. It thoroughly describes the Soviet system and its impact on women, including women’s contribution to the Soviet society. The third sub-chapter includes the representation of women after the independence of Kyrgyzstan. It is about the special program on developing of women’s movement in socio-political life, besides international and state laws on promotion of women’s rights and activities in Kyrgyzstan. Sub-chapter “Dynamics of women’s political rights and activities in Kyrgyzstan” includes charts which show the statistics of men and women participation in legislative and executive branches, including gender indicators in political positions in state services in Kyrgyzstan. The last sub-chapter of chapter II which is “Liberation of women in Kyrgyzstan in XX century” describes women who made contributions and made an impact in Kyrgyzstan in XX century, moreover the bibliographies of women in political arena of Kyrgyzstan. In this thesis the governance of Roza Otunbaeva will be as a case of this work in order to prove that participation of women in decision-making process is effective and resultant. Roza Otunbaeva’s achievements will be thoroughly described in chapter III.
Fortunately, the number of women in Kyrgyzstan who made and still making huge contributions to the social, cultural and political life of the country is increasing. The traditional view of women's participation in political life is focused on exploring such issues as: fair law, development of social and cultural spheres, destruction of corruption and they are fighting to increase the number of women in power structures especially their participation in decision-making processes at different levels. One of the main issues of state, public and international institutions were: the equal access of women in decision-making processes, also their political participation since the accession of Kyrgyzstan to the “Beijing Platform for action for the advancement of women in 1995” and the ratification by the Kyrgyzstan the Convention of the United Nations on the Elimination of all forms of discriminations against women in 1997 (CEDAW).

World practice shows that women's representation in the highest state authorities, in parliaments or governments levels have a competent and effective social policy, also develops the maternal and child welfare, labor and employment. However, the cooperation of men and women strengthens the gender equality and also increases the productivity and efficiency of state projects. This sphere is considered as one of the main indicators of progress of the democratic development of society which is focused on upholding the human rights and human capabilities. That is why it is so important that women are represented on an equal footing with men in the managerial and political positions.

In the lights of statistics on the representation of women at the decision-making level in the Kyrgyzstan for March 8, 2014 shows that in Jogorku Kenesh of Kyrgyzstan there are 27 women in parliament which is 22.5%. However, women in government of Kyrgyzstan are only

---

5 Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsc.kg/22
9 % (3 female ministries from 22 ministries). The number of women in governmental agencies is 0 from 7, and the same number in governmental services – 0 from 10. In funds and inspection sectors of Kyrgyz Republic there is only 1 female in “Health Insurance Fund” from 5 members. From 7 members in governmental representatives there is only 1 woman. In one of the main offices in Kyrgyzstan in National Bank there are 7 members and from them 4 women. In General Prosecutor’s office of the Kyrgyzstan – General Prosecutor- women, while from 3 deputies of attorney general there is 1 woman. In Central Election Commission from 12 members – 4 are women which is 33, 3 %, while in Supreme Court of the Kyrgyz Republic from 25 judges 15 are women which is 60 %. Moreover, in Accounting Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic there are 9 auditors and from them 3 are women which are 33, 3 % and the percentage of women in Local Keneshes is 13, 4%. Besides, from the 44 heads of rayon state administrations there is only 1 woman (Bishkek city, Sverdlovsk region). From the heads of aiyl okmots there are 27 women which is 5, 96% and there is no women from 31 mayors. The measures have been taken in order to increase women’s participation in politics such as: different public and international training programs, campaigns which promote women’s political rights to special regulations and the legislation providing for the involvement of women in various positions in the public administration. But, despite these efforts, until recently the level of representation of women at the political level has steadily declined. This thesis work will try to show the effectiveness of women who take part in political life of Kyrgyzstan and by experience of women who made huge contribution to the social, political and economic spheres of the country. Besides, thesis includes women’s participation in decision-making processes and women’s impact in political life.

The Kyrgyz Republic was one of the first post-Soviet states to adopt the Law “On state guarantees of gender equality” in 2003, which established a mandate to form central

8 Women support center, NGO, “Political Rights of women in Kyrgyzstan”, Brochure “Fund for Gender Equality by UN Women”, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
governmental bodies by fulfilling certain requirements in terms of quotas for women.9 Today, the representation of women in Jogorku Kenesh has declined from 30% (in terms of quotas) to 20% according to practice.10 The democratic way chosen by the Kyrgyzstan which guaranteed equal rights and opportunities for people at the same time state has adopted and implemented a large number of state concepts, strategies and programs not only in the sphere of socio-economic and political reforms, but also has started to develop a program for gender balance. This strategy was created in order to achieve objectives of equality between men and women and it was implemented in 1996 which was proclaimed to be a “Year of Women” by the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyzstan.11 The Kyrgyz Republic Kyrgyzstan had the only female President of the state in the whole Central Asia throughout its history. Contribution of first woman president Roza Otunbaeva to Kyrgyzstan is huge. She has made a great contribution to the development of not only gender equality but also on other spheres of the whole Kyrgyzstan. She was of awarded by international awards for her courage and leadership for social justice and for the respect of human rights. Besides, she developed country’s foreign policy and she was able to keep the country in the most severe moment in the history of Kyrgyzstan. Also, she set Kyrgyzstan on a democratic path and was able represent country’s interests abroad. She was the first one actively supporting the idea of involvement in the decision-making of women and young people.

This thesis will try to show the impact of gender in decision-making processes and that there is no equal participation of women in decision-making processes yet. In order to execute women’s rights there have not been created enough laws which could give more opportunities to perform their rights. But in spite of the small number of women in politics of Kyrgyzstan, I will

try to reveal what and how problems are solved by women-politicians in our country. The most important thing is that women support the agenda on gender mainstreaming in decision-making processes in political sphere of Kyrgyzstan. Besides, women compared to men pay more attention to social problems as well as the people who live in poor conditions because women are more sociable in more favorable terms. We can expect that women have a stronger sense of fairness and justice, and are less prone to corruption than men because women usually have a greater role in rearing their children in the moral values of society and hence would try to be models of morality. Moreover, women being nurturers would use the peaceful means in order to resolve the conflict by which they want to preserve human lives and natural environment.

Gender inequality continues among those employed in the bodies of state governance of Kyrgyzstan. Men occupy key positions in the supreme powers and central offices of the ministries and agencies. The majority of women, occupying managerial positions, have them at the mid-level of governance. The equality in democratic governance especially in decision-making processes was identified as one of the twelve critical areas of concern in "Beijing Platform for Action".\(^\text{12}\) This platform recommends two strategies: first: “to take measures to ensure women's equal access to full participation in power structures and decision-making” and second, “to increase women's capacity to participate in decision-making and leadership”\(^\text{13}\). I will try to show why the participation of women in politics is considered as weak and the factors which influence this process.

This work includes a qualitative research method and analysis of secondary sources (the United Nation “Beijing Platform for Actions”, “Gender relations in Kyrgyz Republic”, “Women political rights in Kyrgyz Republic” and etc.) and primary resources where I conduct interviews.


\(^\text{13}\)Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27,2005;
with women in politics of Kyrgyzstan who take a participation in decision-making processes and from men who work with women who are involved in politics in order to get deep understanding of women actions in politics of Kyrgyzstan.

Chapter I: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

Theoretical Framework: Critical Mass Theory

One of the concepts which describe the women’s political representation is “critical mass” theory.\(^\text{14}\) Sarah Childs and Mona Lena Krook fully describe this concept in their “Critical mass theory and Women’s Political Representation” article. Scholars claimed that “pattern of gender and politics is not tendency of women to hold high positions, but rather to the fact that the number of women is less than men in almost all elected assemblies. Scholars argue that women are not likely to have a major impact on legislative results until they grow from a few numbers of individuals into a significant minority of all legislators. Authors claimed that the number of women will increase after they will be able to work more effectively together in order to promote women’s policy then to influence on males colleagues to accept and approve the policy on promoting women in legislation. The concept of “critical mass” attracted politicians, media and international organizations as a justification for measures in order to bring women into politics.\(^\text{15}\) At the same time, they found an example that women make a difference – and, indeed, perhaps a greater difference- when they form a very small minority.\(^\text{16}\) Women’s development has accelerated a crisis of confidence in “critical mass theory” leading many to question of utility and relevance of women in their representation (Childs, 2004; Sawyer et al, 2006).


In the politics of Kyrgyzstan in order to strengthen women's political participation mandatory quotas were introduced in the electoral legislation in 2007\textsuperscript{17} for under-represented groups on party lists, forming the country's Parliament. The quota principle establishes that the representation of the same sex should not exceed 70\%, while the order in the priority list of candidates should not exceed three positions. This had a dramatic effect after the predominantly male composition of the Kyrgyz Parliament elected in 2005; women, ethnic groups, and youth were subsequently represented in the Parliament.\textsuperscript{18} However, the development of social and cultural spheres changed in Kyrgyzstani citizens’ lives.

In the last decade in political sphere of Kyrgyzstan women’s participation and their representation are increasing. Today, some high positions in politics of Kyrgyzstan are occupied by women. They are lightening the image of the Kyrgyzstan on the world arena and maintain the image of civilized country as a democratic island in the region.\textsuperscript{19} The policy of the President of Kyrgyzstan that appointment of qualified women to the high responsible positions, which require transparent and competent work, and President’s trust into their knowledge and intellect, reflection and high responsibility, intuition and sense of justice.\textsuperscript{20} As it happens in political sphere of Kyrgyzstan, scholar Drude Dahlerup described the situation as “few successful women in top positions may have contributed substantially to the change in the perception of women as politicians, but at the same time the performance of a few outstanding women can contribute to the change rather than their number”\textsuperscript{21} Unfortunately, today there isn’t thought-out, long-term government policy on the systematic promotion of women in positions where decisions are made by them.

\textsuperscript{17} Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsc.kg/22
\textsuperscript{18} Review of Kyrgyzstan “National Review of the Kyrgyzstan in the framework of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action”, informal translation, 31 PDF, e-book
\textsuperscript{20} Ibid
Rosabeth Moss Kanter and Drude Dahlerup are the authors of this concept who researched the concept of “critical mass” and they identified what might be gained or lost in women’s political representation. They provided a complete analysis of the experiences of women who formed small minorities in political spheres. Both authors disquieted with how women respond to dynamics of marginalization in minority situations, each concludes with some speculations as to how these experiences will change as the number of women increases. Drude Dahlerup analyses the political behavior, limits and possibilities of women. The author claims that in patriarchal society the gender perspectives are expressed via sexual harassment, absence of legitimate authority, prejudice female minority's status in society.\(^{22}\) In the case with Kyrgyzstan where “patriarchy” is an obstacle for women’s development in general, and all this come from influence of religion, from culture and traditions which penetrate into all areas of society. In patriarchal society there is increasing number of “nikah” (marriage without registration), polygamy, of divorce through “talaq” (spouses divorce) and bridge kidnapping.\(^{23}\) According to the international Conventions, documents, state laws which are based on equality of rights and opportunities for women in social, economic and political spheres women should promote their rights. Despite all of this Rosabeth Moss Kanter identifies six main areas where women might have an impact in politics: “reaction to women politicians with a decline in sexist treatment and sexual harassment; the performance and efficiency of female politicians, with fewer women who leaves politics; the social climate of political life with the arrival of a more consensual style and family-friendly working arrangements; political discourse, with a redefinition of “political” concerns; the policy-making agenda, with a feminization of the political agenda; and the


influence and power of women in general, with broader social and economic empowerment of women”.

Dahlerup transforms the “critical mass” concept in two ways with important implications on substantive representation of women. Author focuses that one of the opportunities for women will be to form supportive alliances when there is an increased number of women, considering the possibility that women as a group will be grow up more diverse as their number grow, as well as chances for women to have an impact even when they constitute only a very small minority of all political representatives. In the one of the interviews there was a question related to the Dahlerup’s concept that women could make to form supportive alliances: “it’s better to work with women because they are rational and effective, faster in decision-making and in the performance of their duties.” Author argues that specific mechanism for change lie on “critical acts” or initiatives that “change the position of the minority and lead to the further change. These initiatives include the enrollment of other women, also the introduction of quotas for women and new equality legislation and equality institutions, and also depend on “the willingness and the ability of the minority to mobilize the resources of the organization or institutions” in order to improve the situation for themselves and the whole minority group. One of the members of the local kenesh (council) in Kyrgyzstan also commented on the case when men only support men especially in the elections. According to her interview even in the local keneshes (council) men support each other and try to nominate only men.

---

25 Ibid
26 Interview with Bermet Tursunkulova-vice-president of AUCA, April 7,2015
29 Interview with Avazkan Ormonova-director of public fund “DIA”, Deputy of local kenesh; March 30,2015
Dahlerup claimed that feminist women also can have an impact above and beyond for their status if they form alliances with one another despite their small numbers. 30 She still claimed that “critical acts” to larger proportions of women by stating that a “growing feminist consciousness among a growing number of women politicians could mean that women are reaching an important turning point, becoming a critical mass”.31 For instance, a state commission under the government of the Kyrgyzstan for the family, women and youth in cooperation with the National Statistical Committee realizes formation of gender statistics for monitoring and analysis national gender program "Ayalzat"32 in Kyrgyzstan. The main objectives of this program are to promote women's rights in conjunction with human rights and freedoms of men:

- ensuring conditions for the full participation of women and men;
- making at all levels of government;
- promotion of equal rights and equal opportunities in the market labor in the field of business and finance;
- ensuring the health of women and men, increasing life expectancy;
- creation of conditions for active participation of women in the upbringing of children and housekeeping;
- elimination of violence against women33

Mechanisms for implementation of the program "Ayalzat" were some of the specific projects, such as "Women's Health" - the project "Medical and sociological expedition"; project on "Education and awareness of functional literacy of women"34 and others. Dahlerup presents arguments that combine individual and collective explanations by switching between statements

31 Ibid
32 Toktaim Umetalieva, Elvira Aytkulova, Alexander Solomatova “The role of the state in promoting women's rights in Kyrgyzstan”, (Chairman of the Association of NGOs and NPOs), 2-3,PDF e-book.
33 Ibid
34 Ibid
like “the entrance of just one woman into in male group changes the discussion and behavior of that group and the higher the proportion of women will change social conventions”\textsuperscript{35} which also explains how women can impact to the group of males. In the interview with deputy of local kenesh, Avazkan Ormonova she claimed that she is the only woman among male deputies in her district. She said that it’s difficult to be the only woman among men and always try to initiate platform where programs and projects should be approved by male side, and women always try to initiate something in order to strengthen their stability in male dominated group.

The “critical mass” theory explains as a range of different effects to the increasing numbers of women result in greater attention to women’s issue, but at the same time there are cases where increased numbers of women result in little or even no change which means that women may not make a critical mass. These studies assume that the percentage of women in the institution is the key determination of their behavior and they reflect “politics of optimism” that gender differences can be excluded and that women’s progress can proceed on a non-contentious basis, provoking little or no reaction from men as a group.\textsuperscript{36} Yet, scholars discovered that with the growth in number of women, the number and rate of principles of such bills also increase.\textsuperscript{37} These theories suggest that women form coalitions with one another to foresee that a “critical mass” of women will be enough in order to promote women-friendly policy outcomes. However, women may be more effective when they are fewer where they can mobilize individually\textsuperscript{38} or though women’s legislative causes to achieve gains for women without having to contend with the opposition of powerful men.\textsuperscript{39} It says that there is also advantage for women to achieve their goals in getting power.

\textsuperscript{36} Ibid
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid
\textsuperscript{38} Ibid
\textsuperscript{39} Ibid
In conclusion, the "critical mass theory" have played one of the significant roles in the spread of gender quotas around the world which allows successful lobbying for the greater numbers of women in politics so legislatures can make a difference in gender equality debates. In political sphere of Kyrgyzstan "women's phenomena" is promoted through quota system, law implementations, integration of socio-economic and cultural values.

Therefore there are several arguments for women’s political participation. First, they have a model right to be represented in politics because they represent the half of population. Second, whether social, biological and physiological differences make them more experienced in resolving certain issues. Third, since they possess different interests they interest cannot be represented solely by men. Moreover, female politicians try hard to serve as role models for other females. Critical mass theory also argues that women are able to achieve consensus to address their common interests when they achieved certain level of representation. Lastly, the equal representation of men and women facilitates the democratization of the country.  

Chapter II: 1.1: Historical background of women in Kyrgyzstan

Outstanding women in ancient Kyrgyz society

Before the Soviet era the role of women was not important as it was in Soviet or XX century. At that time women play mainly two roles, which were: giving birth and to be obedience to their husbands. There wasn’t any effort from women’s side to overcome the social inequality in that period of time. But despite of all this factors, in the history of formation of Kyrgyzstan there were a lot of women who made contributions for the developing of Kyrgyz society. Our Kurmanjan Datka was known as a “master of diplomatic etiquette” at that time, who conducted on equal diplomatic talks with government officials and ambassadors of other

states. She was known as “Alai queen” could solve complex issues on mutual agreement which were acceptable for both sides. She had a brilliant logic and extensive knowledge in all areas of political and social life at that controversial and challenging era (Usubalieva, 2015). Even in Kyrgyz-heroic epos “Manas” the image of women was illustrated that Kyrgyz people had a special relationship to women. “In creating the "perfect" image of women means the heroic epic style Kyrgyz legend — the “Manas” trilogy has no analogues in the world. The image of heroic women was Kanykei, “the idea of the ideal women. Nomadic consciousness saw her as beautiful, timeless traits of femininity and tenderness, kindness and steadfastness of faith, hope and love, also support and compassion, the stronghold of the family heart and Kyrgyz society”(Usubalieva, 2015).

Another hero-woman of Kyrgyz society is Janyl Myrza who was a strong, dexterous, daring and brave. She protected her people from enemies, brutally murders who disturbed freedom and human dignity. The extraordinary physical strength of Janyl is combined with the organizational skills as a chief and military commander. She always was surrounded by friendly and hardworking people. Legend about the Janyl Myrza describes the life, customs and powerfulness of Kyrgyz people at that era.

In early years of socialism a person who was remembered as “an activist of social change in South part of Kyrgyzstan was Urkuya Salieva. She was one of the first women who joined the Communist Party and progressed through it ranks from Komsomol to full party membership. She was one of the strong leaders among Kyrgyz women and was elected as a chief in her region in 1928 when she was at 18. She was one of the early feminists at that time that defended the women’s rights. In 1934, the same year in which she was killed, she became a member of the government of the Kyrgyz Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic. Women

---

44 Ibid
heroes made a big contribution for the development of Kyrgyzstan and proved that women can also make a real decisions on certain issues related to politics even at that time, and Urkuya Salieva was one of the greatest woman’s who made for the further development of Kyrgyz society.

**Promotion of women in Soviet Period**

Kyrgyz society passed from a nomadic life to a settled life, at the same time experiencing industrialization, collectivization and the important one- female emancipation. The Soviet policy where were direct and drastic measures and served as a powerful stimulus for women to see themselves equal with men by possessing equal rights as fully fledged members of the society. Eventually, the only purpose of the family itself would be to unite women and men solely for love. That was the ideal condition of things in Communist society in the opinion of the Bolshevik revolutionaries.\(^{45}\) At that time in Central Asia, “the campaign called Hoodjoom (Attack) started to promote in the South part of Kyrgyz ASSR female population to enlist them to the new power by releasing them from noticeable of Islam religion. One of the public actions of this campaign was public burning of paranja.”(Frantz Fanon, 2000). One of the obstacles of women emancipation was Islam which was dominant among the local population. Frantz Fanon has suggested that the same tendencies in the society can be observed in colonial Algeria in early 1930s when the French government (like Soviet government in Central Asia) implemented the following tactic: “*Let’s win over the women and the rest will follow*”. In both cases, the new power fought Islam in the first instance by trying to occupy its place in the society.\(^{46}\) One of the reasons that Soviet government gave a big attention to women is that women were sensitive to the effects of power. Eventually, it was a big profit for Soviet Union needed to have a strong internal power and some kind of basis for the state economy, social development as culture, education, public health and realization of the ideological principles of socialism (Frantz Fanon, 2000).

---


\(^{46}\) Ibid
2000). Nevertheless, the Bolsheviks were the first in the history of Kyrgyz society to try to emancipate women, and in 1936, Stalin’s constitution officially proclaimed the achievement of the complete equality of the sexes. From 1990s there wasn’t a concrete power on protection and controlling social life and the result of this transformation was very harsh. In Soviet period the percentage of women in labor force was 83 %, but today women form the majority of the unemployment in Kyrgyzstan. Thereby, the creation of independent Kyrgyz society has escalated women's stable social level of living. It was showed in percentage of unemployment of Kyrgyz women if in 1991-1992 it was 3 %, so in 1993-1994 became from 5-10 %

But the more dramatic changes for the worse were registered in the quotas of women in the upper echelons of the state power. According to data from the Central Electoral Commission of the Kyrgyz Republic, in the elections of 1994 only 27 women or 8 percent became deputies, while in 1996 the number was cut down to 5 women or 4, 1 percent. The number had continued to decrease and in 1998 only 4 women or 3, 9 % were presented as the deputies in the Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic. There is thus a substantial disparity between women’s quota in the total population of Kyrgyzstan (about 51%) and their actual participation in political progress. The Soviet period had a huge impact to the whole Kyrgyzstan which considered as historical influence to all spheres of life including the gender issue. One of the main achievements was the liberation and emancipation of women. Besides, policy considering women development was one of the big goals in women's history at all. Communist Party were developed special forms and methods of work among women by taking into account local conditions. A real and effective participation of women in public life was provided by quotas. State supervised the labor security of women and their working conditions and provided by all facilities for nursing

48 Ibid
49 Ibid
mothers, families with many children, mothers-heroines, etc. Active, purposeful and consistent ideological and propaganda work, supports the installation of the party, held by specially created women's committees, departments and organizations. Despite some decorative and full independence from party control, they acted as a public platform and are proof of the power of understanding the specificity of women's issues in society. However, until 1990s the recognition of equality between men and women de facto was flashy because of biological factor differences especially in the economic and political spheres. Later, women started to involve in doctoral studies, their growth was by involving in science, which was a tradition of Soviet era. As German philosopher Kant wrote that “every age has its own unique look and its significance is determined by the intellectual level of women, because women have basis of the existence of any form of civilization.” (Bekturanova Kulbyubyu Arykovna, 2009).

The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan after Soviet Era

After Kyrgyzstan became an independent country in 1995, for the first time, the delegation of sovereign Kyrgyz Republic women participated in the “IV World Conference on women in Beijing”. This participation has become a new era of women's movement in the Republic-era rethinking of women's and gender issues and in 1996 Jogorku Kengesh on the Kyrgyz Republic has ratified five conventions on women's rights. Kyrgyzstan in 1996 has been declared the year of women and was created the State Commission for family, women and young people. Besides, in the period 1996-2000 was developed by the national program "Ayalzat"("Women") for the advancement of women of the Kyrgyz Republic. In 1999 was submitted the first national report to the CEDAW committee (Women Support Center). After in in 2000 The State Commission for family, women and youth was changed into the National Council on women,

52 Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsf.kg/22
53 Ibid
family and gender development reporting to the President of the Kyrgyz Republic to ensure the inclusion of a gender component in all aspects of national policies, strategies and programs. Also at these years was held a national Conference "Women of Kyrgyzstan at the turn of the century" in Bishkek. In this conference were reviewed the results of the implementation of the national program "Ayalzat" and the plan of action for achieving gender equality in the Kyrgyz Republic for the period 2002-2006.54 One of the main goals of this program were: actions to maintain women rights, to form conditions for equal participation of women and men in decision making process on all levels, formation of equal rights and equal opportunities in labor market, industry and finances, protection of men and women health, to increase the average life expectancy, To create conditions for active participation of men in the process of bringing up their children, taking care of the household, prevention of violence toward women. The main goal of “Ayalzat” national program, as a promotion of women interests, was a qualitative breakthrough in the position of women in the society by 2000 year. Mechanisms and methods for implementation of “Ayalzat” program were enforced in specific projects, such as: in direction of perfection of legal base was implemented “Gender analysis of legislation in Kyrgyz Republic” project, then “In direction of protection of women health was implemented “Medical sociological expedition” project, “In direction of women education and women literacy was implemented “Women and education” project, also “In direction of development of women position in the society was implemented“ Regional Centers of Women Initiatives” project, besides was implemented the project “Women, Economy and poverty elimination. At same year was adopted the law on the reproductive rights of citizens.55 In 2001 was held a National Conference on which was called "Women in the turn of the century". Then in 2002 by the decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic was approved the national plan of action for achieving the gender equality in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2002-2006 years. At the same year President of the Kyrgyz Republic signed

54 Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsc.kg/22
decree for recruiting women leaders for the state administration of the Kyrgyz Republic. In 2003 the Legislative body of Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic adopted two laws relating to domestic violence and equality of rights and opportunities of women. In 2004 was initiated a network of “NGO Council” and on the behalf of the NGO council (7 NGOs) submitted an alternative report to CEDAW Committee.\textsuperscript{56} In 2005 year was held a National Forum of women’s organizations and at the same year the President decreed on institution of the Special Representative of the President of Kyrgyz Republic on gender development in Jogorku Kenesh.

In 2006 year the President signed decree “on measures to improve gender policy” and was ratified the Optional Protocol to CEDAW committee. In the new edition of the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic (2010) was established the principle of equality of rights and opportunities between men and women in 2007.\textsuperscript{57} Besides, at this year was introduction of gender quotas in the law “on political parties”. The third periodic report of the Government of Kyrgyzstan to the CEDAW committee was in 2008 and also alternative report of the NGO Council to the CEDAW committee and was initiated the alliance of women Legislative Initiative (AWLI).\textsuperscript{58}

As you can see from the above list of activities, the development of a gender policy in Kyrgyzstan was conducted jointly by both the State and the women's movement. It should be noted that initially, the ratification of international conventions, the adoption of laws on women's rights were not accompanied by declarations of progress in their implementation. Almost every action which was taken by the State initiated and lobbied by women's organizations. Among them were the most active organizations such as: “Agency of Social technologies”, “Women's support center”, “Association of women entrepreneurs”, “Alga”, “Association of crisis centers”, “Sezim” (Psychological Crisis Centre), the Centre for gender studies, women leaders, the leader of the Djalalabad and Karakol cities.\textsuperscript{59} One of the issues which will be discussed in the further

\textsuperscript{56} Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsc.kg/22
\textsuperscript{57} Women support center, NGO, “The history of the women's movement in Kyrgyzstan”, http://wsc.kg/22
\textsuperscript{58} Ibid
\textsuperscript{59} Ibid
chapters will about the women participation in political sphere of the state. Further we’ll see the efficiency of female participation in decision-making processes

*Dynamics of women’s political rights and activities in Kyrgyzstan*

First step on women’s development was recognized in 1996 when was a Ratification of the Convention on the political rights of women of 20/12/1952. Moreover, after one year country ratified the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of discrimination against women (CEDAW) which considers as one of the main and important documents of the United Nations, where was created a special committee on women. In this Convention, the Article 7 says that: “the political participation of women at all levels of the electoral system; Special measures and quotas for women in electoral system; participation in the formulation of Government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform at all levels of governance; participation in the activities of NGOs and associations. In addition, Article 8 about the women’s international representation and their participation.”

Later, in 2002 was signed a Decree of the President of the Kyrgyzstan "on further improvement of the framework policy for recruiting women leaders for the State administration of the Kyrgyzstan" where main goals were on introduction of gender-sensitive approaches in the human resources policy of the Kyrgyzstan through the allocation of quotas for women. In 2007, the Code of Kyrgyzstan says about “on elections in Kyrgyzstan” in Article 72, paragraph 3 about “in determining the list of candidate’s political party must take into account the representation: of no more than 70 % of persons of the same sex, the difference of priority in women’s and men’s lists of candidates put forward by political parties, not to exceed three positions”. An important stage in the expansion of women's political participation in the government, at the decision-making level, was the adoption in 2008 of a new edition of the Law “On State

---


61 Ibid
Guarantees of Equal Rights and Equal Opportunities for Men and Women” (Women Support Center Report).

Specific mechanisms to ensure gender equality at the decision-making levels in the legislative, executive and judicial branches of government were identified. Specifically, the guarantees of equal rights and opportunities in public service are provided through the mechanism of equal competitive selection, and forbidding a tender announcement for one specific sex.62 Besides, Article 9 is about the guarantee on gender equality in the administration of the state, and in Article 10 is about the guarantee on gender equality in the public and municipal services. The new Constitution of the Kyrgyzstan (2010) consolidated the rules prohibiting discrimination and equal opportunities for women in elected bodies in State and municipal service.63 In the Constitutional law of the Kyrgyzstan on “election of the President of Kyrgyzstan and deputies to the Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyzstan” in the Article 60 says “no more than 70 % of persons of the same sex, the difference of priority in women’s and men’s lists of candidates put forward by political parties, not exceed three positions” and the same condition was implemented in the Article 49, in paragraph 7, which says: “in the formation of the lists of candidates in the district and city keneshes political parties and groups of voters are obliged to take into account the representation of not more than seventy per cent of persons of the same sex, the difference of priority in women's and men's lists of candidates put forward by political parties and groups of voters, not to exceed two position”.64

As shown in Figure 1, despite a slight decline in the proportion of women in the Parliament of the fifth convocation, critical representation of both sexes is provided by the electoral system.

63 Ibid
In general, representation of women among the deputies of local councils in 2012 was only 16 percent, or 1,326 women against 6,753 men (for comparison: in the composition of representative bodies of local self-government in 2006, the proportion of women MPs was 19.1 percent, and of men - 80.9 percent). In accordance with the law and practice on management, political parties are main step in order to entry and promotion of authority into the political decision-making level. The absence of regulatory mechanisms on promotion the gender equality leads to a very low level of women's representation (National Review of Kyrgyzstan; Beijing Declaration).

As shown in Figure 2, the proportion of women among the heads of Ail Okmoty does not exceed 5 percent, and only on January 1, 2014 this indicator increased by 0.6 percentage points compared to the year of 2013 – out of 453 heads of Ail Okmoty, 24 were women (National Review of Kyrgyzstan; Beijing Declaration).

Figure 2(Review of Kyrgyzstan ,“National Review of the Kyrgyz Republic in the framework of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action”, informal translation, 31 PDF, e-book.)

---

In Figure 3 showed that the national level of participation of women in government as a whole is also showing a negative trend.

Figure 3 (Review of Kyrgyzstan, “National Review of the Kyrgyz Republic in the framework of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action”, informal translation, 31 PDF, e-book.)

By charts which are in review from 2008-2012 it seems that even special measures did not effectively impact to the situation and to the gender representation in the executive and legislative branches of government. Author claimed it as concept of "washout of women" (Figure 4, National Review of Kyrgyzstan; Beijing Declaration) Despite of this chart there were high positions to which President of Kyrgyzstan nominated women to the
high positions, maybe for 2015 year review the percentage of women’s representation will be different.

**Figure 4** (*Review of Kyrgyzstan; “National Review of the Kyrgyz Republic in the framework of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action”, informal translation, 31 PDF, e-book.)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Executive Branch</th>
<th>Legislative Branch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>60.1</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>76.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>60.9</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>55.2</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The researchers claimed that one of the main reasons for this situation is lack of state control over the implementation of provisions of the law on establishing gender balance in political decision-making, which should be carried out by the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic and the General Prosecutor of the Kyrgyz Republic. Also, the present quota mechanism, both at the national and local elections of deputies, is in need of improvement, because it does not guarantee preservation of deputy mandates for women after the election (*National Review of Kyrgyzstan; Beijing Declaration*).

**Liberation of women in Kyrgyzstan in XX century**

The 20th century is significant by phenomenon of “female revolution” to the historical arena. Female factor persistently breaking into a modern map of the world requires a rethinking of existing foundations of civilization, pushing the brand new topical problems of determining the place of women in modern society which further progress the possibility and sustainable human development.
The international community, including such organizations as the United Nations, the International Labor Organization, and World Health Organization consider the question of the status of women as global problems of humanity.66 Women represent a significant part of the global labor market and have become their habit to work outside the home and receive equal pay for equal work. The United Nations 58 years ago created special units and agencies devoted to the problems of equality and advancement of women, as the World Bank has established a council of experts on gender issues, which suggests a new approach to this issue. As the World Conference on Women, declaring 1975 the International Year of Women Mexico and Nairobi to Beijing, on the initiative and the insistence of some for more than 30 years of fruitful activity is to change the status of women in politics, in economics and in society.67 In Western Europe, Southeast Asia, several countries in Latin America, women have taken power into their own hands; have proved that they have enough abilities to solve questions of worldwide importance. The phenomenon of how the women's movement also increased at the national including Kyrgyzstan and international levels which became a factor in politics.

Even in Kyrgyzstan where Islamic views stated that women cannot be admitted for power, and that females shouldn’t have right to rule over men, and implement a policy. However, in the history of other countries especially with strong developed Islam and before there had been examples of women who controlled states from that time. As an example Prime Ministers such as Benazir Bhutto in Pakistan and Tansu Chiller in Turkey.68 Nowadays, a lot of women working president, prime minister, speaker of parliament, ministers, even the head of the armed forces and security services, and thus the real events are not surprised. Because of this, some women are worthy rivals of men in leadership positions. As mentioned above, despite the established stereotyped and conservative views, pleased that in recent years in Kyrgyzstan female

67 Ibid
68 Atai Altymyshev, “Women have a special place in politics and government” (“У женщин особое место в политике и власти”), noted in Erkin-Too newspaper №17-18 от 06.03.2015, page 5, last modified in March 17, 2015, http://roza.kg/2015/03/17/u-zhenshin-osoboe-mesto-v-politike-i-vlasti
representatives is actively involved in public life, government important things in order to occupy senior positions. This phenomenon does not come from the development of the feminist movement in the West, but actually proves that the country's gender policy is beginning to step in the right direction.

Big contributions to the development of Kyrgyzstan were made by women as Kulyupa Konduchalova, Janyl Tashibekova, Janyl Tumenbaeva, Shatkul Kudabayev, Kulbubu Bekturganova, Mira Djangaracheva, Cholpon Baekova, Roza Otunbayeva, holding ministerial and other senior positions at various levels, proved that they are experienced leaders. Each of them did and making big contribution for the development of Kyrgyzstan as in national and international levels.

One of the icons of Kyrgyz society was Kulyupa Konduchalova who has made great political heights, working as Secretary of the Presidium of the Supreme Soviet of Kyrgyz SSR, Deputy Chairman of the Council of nationalities of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR, the Vice-President of the Council of Ministers, the Minister for Foreign Affairs of the Kyrgyz SSR. She is a legend culture of Kyrgyzstan. At her 22 years old she served as a Minister of Culture.\(^6^9\) Her name is inseparably linked to cultural policies, improving the system of cultural and educational institutions. The culture of Kyrgyzstan started to talk about Kulyupa Konduchalova to the whole world proclaiming her as Aitmatov’s phenomenon- "The Miracle of the Kyrgyz cinema" which rose in Kyrgyz ballet.\(^7^0\) By the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic Kulyupa Konduchalova was awarded by the highest award "Hero of the Kyrgyz Republic" with giving her a special plaque "Ak Shumkar". She is Commander of the order of Lenin and also two orders of the red banner of labor, order of the badge of honor, six medals, honored as a worker of culture.

---

One of the women’s leaders is Janyl Tahibekova who has made an enormous contribution to the development of foreign Affairs of the Kyrgyz Republic. She managed to work in two systems from 1980 till 1986 as a female leader in foreign affairs sphere. The ministry of Foreign Affairs worked with very high responsibilities with its duties especially after Janyl Tashibekova’s successful work in USSR delegation at the “XXV session of the United Nation General Assembly” and after that was increased a number of visitors to Kyrgyzstan. One of the first officially visitors to USSR was an ambassador of China in 1981. However, such visits of Chinese officials gave a special significance to the Russian and Chinese relationships after their twenty years of break. Moreover, at the same year were held French days which attracted the ambassador of France Mr. Jean-Claude Arnaud to visit USSR with its official visit to “Day of France” in Kyrgyzstan. Also, a visit of Indian Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi to the Kyrgyz SSR made a big influence on bilateral relations (interview with former minister of Foreign Affairs of Kyrgyzstan, Janyl Tashibekova)

This officially visits became a big opportunity for Kyrgyzstan to participate in different international events. After, Kyrgyzstan became a participant of event “Days of the USSR” as example of the Kyrgyz SSR in France, Yemen, Arab Republic, Czechoslovakia, Switzerland and many other countries. However, participation in such events had a positive impact on employees of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs which began to develop ties of mutual understanding, respect and cooperation further with other countries.

She is known as “iron woman” in Kyrgyz society where behind of her were decided the fate of numerous court decisions, and the fate of all citizens and entire people. Cholpon Baekova

---

71 Ibid
72 Foreign Ministry of Kyrgyzstan, “They stood at the origins of diplomacy” (trans. from “Они стояли у истоков дипломатии”), interview with ex-foreign Minister of the Kyrgyz SSR Janyl Tashibekova, http://mfa.gov.kg/contents/view/id/208
73 Foreign Ministry of Kyrgyzstan, “They stood at the origins of diplomacy” (trans. from “Они стояли у истоков дипломатии”), interview with ex-foreign Minister of the Kyrgyz SSR Janyl Tashibekova, http://mfa.gov.kg/contents/view/id/208
started her profession in very early years and for now she achieved excellent goals. From 1969-1977 she was a Prosecutor of Kyrgyz SSR, and in 1982 became a member of the Supreme Court of Kyrgyz SSR. Cholpon Baekova worked as a chairman of the Issyk-Kul oblast court from 1982-1985. After, in 1985 till 1988 she was a chairman of the Issyk-Kul regional trade union council. From 1988 till 1990 became the first Deputy and Minister of Justice of Kyrgyz SSR. She is a former chairman of the Standing Committee of the Armed Forces of the Kyrgyz Republic on economy. Since 1995 she was appointed as a Chairman of the International Congress of Women of Central Asia. Later, from 1993-2007 became a Chairman of the Constitutional Court of the Kyrgyz Republic. Since December 2007 she started to work in Jogorku Kenesh and became a Deputy Toraga/Chairman of Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic. Besides, from 2011 she started to teach students in Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University in Bishkek.

For that period of her work in governmental structured institutions she was awarded for several nominations as: Diploma of the Kyrgyz Republic for "Merited lawyer of Kyrgyzstan" and winner of the Russian Award "Themis-2000". Former president of Kyrgyzstan, Akaev signed a decree for the “highest qualifications class” judicial officer in 2004 for Cholpon Baekova. Moreover, she was a honored lawyer of the Kyrgyz Republic (1994), awarded: Honorary Diploma of the Kyrgyz Republic (1995), the Order of "Manas" grade 3 (1997.), the order of "Manas" II degree (11.2009), the International Prize "Kurmanjan Datka “, association "Rukhaniyat" (1999), the international supreme legal premium "Themis-2000" (2000) awarded by the Moscow club of lawyers, judges of the highest qualification class (2004), the International Prize "International Professional 2007" and "Outstanding intellectual of 21st century" (2007) awarded by the International Biographical Centre of Cambridge (England).

---

75 Ibid
76 Ibid
A person, who is a dedicated researcher and promoter of the role and place of outstanding, talented women in history of formation and development of education, culture, science, economy of the Kyrgyzstan is Kulbubu Bekturganova.\textsuperscript{78} She was born in Bishkek and she graduated from Moscow chemical-technological Institute of Mendeleev, also she had received the specialty of engineer-technologist to the Ministry of construction of the Kyrgyz SSR. However, she worked as an engineer-technologist of the trust in "Frunzegorstroi", and she was a senior engineer of “story industry” at the Frunze Polytechnic Institute of building production. Kulbubu Bekturganovu can rightly be called the first female of the Kyrgyzstan who became an engineer-technologist for large-panel.\textsuperscript{79} From 1973 to 1985 she worked in the Central Committee of the Communist Party of Kyrgyzstan. She honored worker of culture, candidate of historical sciences and public figure. She was a member in Bureau of the Committee of Soviet women, a member of the women's Committee of Kyrgyzstan, a member of the women's Federation of the Kyrgyz Republic and she headed the Soviet women in Angolan People’s Republic of China.\textsuperscript{80} She is as a figure that developed the cultural sphere of youth of Kyrgyzstan, at the same time she was honored awards for her outstanding engineering.

A person who firstly represented the Parliament of Kyrgyzstan on Beijing Conference was Mira Djangaracheva.\textsuperscript{81} She is a candidate of philosophical sciences, assistant professor and ex-Member of Parliament of Kyrgyzstan from 1995 till 1996. She is a former deputy-prime minister of government of Kyrgyzstan in 1996-1998. She was a minister of labor and social protection in 1999-2000 and now she is a member of UNDP in Kyrgyzstan. Mira Djangaracheva’s purpose in the field of politics was to use her capacities, knowledge, and experience to advance the interests of women and men, gender equality and social issues. She said the quotas which were introduced

\textsuperscript{78}National Library of Kyrgyzstan, "The Kyrgyz woman in myths and legends" (trans. from "Кыргызская женщина в мифах и легендах") February 26, 2015, http://nlkr.gov.kg/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=1440&Itemid=1
\textsuperscript{79} Ibid
\textsuperscript{80} Ibid
\textsuperscript{81} Human rights movement “Bir Duino”, independent-public-political newspaper “Pluraslim” noted Mira Djangaracheva: “"The role of women in the development of society should be the agenda of the civilized governments"; www.anticorruption.kg , www.birduino.kg, #29,February, 2015, p.4,
in Parliament because of the fact that in Parliament there were no women. And those quotas were considered as necessary, as a critical measure. But on the other hand quotas will be as a tool in order to ensure the involvement of women to the decision making levels. She said: “a large parish of professional women with the knowledge and skills can solve the socio-economic issues such as: the number of unregistered marriages, the vulnerability of women, reduction of violence against women, the birth rate among teenage girls, the maternal mortality rate remains high, alarmingly growing disability among girls and women, poverty, malnutrition and deteriorating environment workman diseases.”

Mira Djangaracheva is one of the icons who developed female representation in international arena and she defends women’s interests and rights in Kyrgyzstan.

Women of Kyrgyzstan from the history invested as much to their work by defending the interests of women in the national and international levels. Today, the country can be proud of the fact that the women of Kyrgyzstan had a great influence on making decisions. By biographies of these women, we can tell that they were fighting not only for their own interests but also they defend the interests of the country which means that women are not afraid to speak, to protect and to make decisions. All the awards they have received indicate that they have developed almost all the structures of the country. Today, women leaders of Kyrgyzstan have access to use of international human rights protection systems, also were given the opportunity to appeal to the UN Commission on human rights and on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. Women of Kyrgyzstan were the first who managed to hold the first Parliamentary hearings on the status of women in the country. If we look deeply, they all started from scratch, but reached the international level by getting international awards. Women of Kyrgyzstan can be considered as unique and comprehensive because they solve problems and fates of people and the state’s while they performed the role of mothers, daughters, sisters at the same time.

---

82 Human rights movement “Bir Duino”, independent-public-political newspaper “Pluraslim” noted Mira Djangaracheva: “‘The role of women in the development of society should be the agenda of the civilized governments’”, www.anticorruption.kg, www.birduino.kg, #29,February, 2015, p.4,
Chapter III: How gender impacts the decision-making processes

In order to measure the impact of gender in decision-making processes, expert Rosa Linda T. Miranda in her article “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making” included the reasons of women weaknesses in politics and steps in order to overcome the difficulties. By the example of first female president of Kyrgyzstan, Roza Otunbaeva we’ll see what kind of barriers she experienced and she was able to defeat barriers in her political experience.

Politics is reputed to be dirty where ways are often illegal and not morally correct in order “to win in elections and assume power and where corruption in public offices for personal and other group’s interests has been recognized as a norm.”83 Every human being has the right to participate in decisions that define his/her life. This right means that women and men have equal participation in decision-making processes. It argues that since women know their situation best, women should participate equally with men to have their perspectives effectively incorporated at all levels of decision-making, from private to public spheres of their lives from the local to the global levels.

The United Nations “Fourth World Conference on Women” which was held in 1995 recognized key condition for women’s empowerment, which became a requirement for democratic governance and was identified as one of twelve critical areas of concern in its Beijing Platform for Action (BPA).84 For this concern, the platform recommends two strategies: first, “to take measures to ensure women's equal access to and full participation in power structures and decision-making” and second, “increase women's capacity to participate in decision-making and

83 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27,2005
leadership." Both strategies are proposed to be addressed by “governments, national bodies, the private sector, political parties, trade unions, employer’s organizations, research and academic institutions, sub-regional and regional bodies, and non-governmental and international organizations.” However, many women in developing countries have come to some consensus that politics has to be transformed, and that political transformation needs the active involvement of women. Therefore, women who believe in serving the public trust and can commit to public accountability should enter politics to effect this transformation. Rosa Linda T. Miranda’s paper describes reasons why the participation of women in politics makes doubts:

a) Majority of women have been socialized with traditional roles especially in patriarchal society and they combined traditional values of inequality between women and men. It’s better that women are self-made or self-taught feminist, but unfortunately trainings which are considered to help women raise their gender realization will be difficult because of the deep socialization of traditional values of women and the patriarchal values are barriers to initiate something for women. Moreover, religious views of the whole population also make a sense not to allow women for public places. Despite all of these obstacles female leaders of Kyrgyzstan tried to participate in decision making processes to solve the fate of the whole nation. It seems to be difficult for them to play two roles in family and in public sphere at the same time.

Rosa Linda T. Miranda claimed that “women in order to become candidates for certain male political office they try not to focus on gender concerns because it will neglect the interests of men. They tend “to choose commitments that appeal to the interests of the general public” which will cover all issues in their program. It’s better for politicians “to pay deep

---

86 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27, 2005;
87 Ibid
attention to every specific sphere of the society, rather than speak about national interest.»

From one hand its true, that every person who takes the responsibility to solve the issue of the whole population, but from the another hand the example of Roza Otunbaeva’s governing is the best version in order to prove the possibility to make decisions in both areas at the same time.

From the experience of transitional President Roza Otunbaeva solved many issues considering the whole population. For example, after becoming a transitional president, Roza Otunbaeva paid attention to the work of law enforcement agencies. She has set the task for law enforcement officers to combat crime. Besides, she was an initiator of closing casinos and gambling halls in the country that harm ordinary citizens and enrich criminals. At the same time, she was one of those women who actively supported the idea of women to participate in decision-making of women and young people for which the country created a separate Ministry of youth affairs in Kyrgyzstan.

Rosa Linda T. Miranda describes the society needs which include: equality (including gender equality and equity) peace, sustainable development, democratic governance, and accountable and efficient government, the often cited basic goals for a paradigm shift to transform our society. In one hand, she said that it’s impossible to change our society’s core values through a small and increasing number of women in politics. From another hand, she claimed that women can assist somehow in order to achieve this or that agenda but they will need the critical mass of public in order to achieve it and then demand it from politicians. One of the most critical determinants which explain that women can make a difference is a nature of her governance and the political mainstream where women are beginning to participate. First of all, people who want to take a part in process of decision-making should possess a public trust.

---
88 Ibid
89 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27,2005;
Political mainstream also can impact from the nature of accountability of elected or appointed public officials.\textsuperscript{90}

In developed countries’ programs and platforms of political parties the basics for voters’ choices in elections and those who elected is responsibility for implementing the program of their parties. However, if there is enough demand on gender concerns to be addressed then political parties would be sensitive to these needs and they will try to integrate these into their political platforms.\textsuperscript{91} Women candidates would have a big and better chance in negotiating and integration if they propose gender concerns into parties which later will become a commitment of the whole party. Gender concerns might be a positive effect in the platform of parties comparing with conquering parties. Moreover, well-established level of accountability on gender issues in the platform of winning party will say about their addressing.\textsuperscript{92}

Author explains another side of political parties and its impact on society. This situation happens mostly in not very developed countries where political system, citizens are politically not mature and voters tend to choose personalities rather than political platforms. It explains as that political parties or its candidates may not have a coherent policy and program but rather a random set of campaign promises on which elected candidates could easily deny. This leads to the fact that voters cannot demand responsibility from elected public officials.\textsuperscript{93} However, elected officials can use their power to serve personal, family, party and patron's interests above those of a wider constituency of general public, while voters feel powerless in changing this situation and wait out the completion of the official's terms of office. If there is no effective public accountability in public office, women's participation would not succeed the

\textsuperscript{90} Ibid
\textsuperscript{91} Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27,2005;
\textsuperscript{92} Ibid
\textsuperscript{93} Ibid
inclusion and implementation of agenda in the platform of their political party (Rosa Linda T. Miranda).

Women must exercise their right and responsibility to participate equally with men in governance. The impact of women’s participation in politics can only be guaranteed by following that women have to bring a transformative agenda of equality, sustainable development, peace, democratic governance, and accountable and efficient government to the society that at the end women will take ownership of this agenda. Besides, in the “Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women” which was signed by 180 member countries of the United Nations could be a main instrument for promoting gender equality and should be undertaken for girls and women, and also boys and men. It will help girls and women understand and appreciate gender equality and will help them assimilate these rights and claim their rights, and at the same time boys and men will also understand women’s equal rights and also promote and protect them.

Rosa Linda T. Miranda suggested that promotion of gender equality should be acquired via trainings which develop teachers and parents on how to apply and teach the values of human rights, equality and especially gender equality and democratic governance in family and schools. More work should be done to advocate and assist relatively hierarchical institutions like religious organizations on how the values of equality, including gender equality can be enhanced in their structures, procedures and programs. Author suggested one of the main goals will be to strengthen the responsibilities among women as well as men to organize themselves into active interest groups or districts. These organized districts will help them to define their priority agenda and influence the political decision-making bodies in government to address these by ensuring their representation in these bodies. Women’s greater participation in organizations and NGOs could be assisted to develop into active political constituencies that will strengthen public accountability as a culture in politics. In order to get to the public political office women have to get mentoring on similar trainings and preparations which should be
undertaken. One of the options for political women is to have an agreement with citizen’s group on agendas and have close partnership relations with each other in order to ensure the implementations on their agenda with mutual accountabilities.

Gender mainstreaming is one of the main strategies recommended by the “Beijing Platform of Action that was endorsed by the UN member states in the 1995” in the Fourth World Conference on Women. Gender mainstreaming has been encouraged in many countries for about two decades and yet the goal of gender equality is still far from being achieved and not even monitored adequately. It is also essential that in government sector of gender should be also encouraged and assisted among all sectors and to widen the commitment among all sectors to achieve goals.\textsuperscript{94} As one of the examples for this was the participation of Kyrgyzstan in a number of Special Session and conferences of the United Nations General Assembly, dedicated to preparing for “Beijing 5” (“Gender Equality in Kyrgyzstan”, UNFPA, 2002).

From the articles and theories which claim that women can impact in male society and can play a role by her appearance and existence in the male group. In order to achieve or make an impact there are steps for women to gain a place in political arena. The first thing for which women need to pay attention is to feminization of the agenda or growing feminist consciousness among a growing number of women politicians could mean that women are reaching an important turning point, becoming a critical mass which will help male society to pay attention too. Second thing is that number of women could increase after they will able to work effectively together in order to promote women’s policy then influence on males colleagues to accept and approve the policy on promoting women’s legislation.

As it was mentioned in previous chapters that scholars Sarah Childs and Lena Krook found an example that “women make a difference – and, indeed, perhaps a greater difference- when they form a very small minority (Childs, Krook) which means that there could

\textsuperscript{94} Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27,2005;
not be barriers for women to demonstrate and defend their interests and rights especially in male dominated groups or societies.

However, Dahlerup focuses on “the opportunity for women to form supportive alliances when there is an increased number of women and their possibility than women to have an impact even if they in small minority of political representatives”. It explained that one women in male group changes the discussion and behavior of that group and higher proportion of women can change the social conversation which also described as impact of women in male’s group. At the same time, fortunately scholars discovered that the number of women increase, the number and rate of principles of such bills also increases. Scholars Sarah Childs and Lena Krook claimed that “women may be more effective when they are fewer where they can mobilize individually or though women’s legislative causes to achieve gains for women without having to contend with the opposition of powerful” (Sarah Childs, Mona Lena Krook “Critical Mass Theory and Women’s Political Representation”). By this we can conclude that gender impacts on decision-making process that women can also make decision, even if they are as a small group, or as it was mentioned that even one woman will be in male dominated group can mobilize individually and increase female’s participation by creating agendas on gender equality issues. From another hand, in parties where there are women more opportunity to win in the elections, because society is interesting that women's participation will help to overcome the problems on society as social, cultural and political. Issues such as, the development of reproductive health or party with the presence of women is far from corruption.

**Women leader- Roza Otunbaeva in Kyrgyzstan’s political arena**

Kyrgyzstan has experienced two terrible revolutions and ethnic conflict in Southern part of Kyrgyzstan. In difficult times for our country, especially in 2010 Roza Otunbayeva became the first female president in patriarchal region and first female president in the whole Central Asian

---

history. Kyrgyzstan has had in its history women-governers such as: Kurmanjan Datka and Janyl-Myrza as it was mentioned in previous chapters. Moreover, the way of life of the Kyrgyz as the nomadic people who lived in difficult environmental conditions, had the equal participation of women in overcoming life's challenges. It was not obvious that woman as Roza Otunbaeva who has a huge political experience has led the country in such difficult period for the country. She played an important role in the overthrow of two authoritarian regimes in Kyrgyzstan in March 2005 and in April 2010 in June 2010 year in the referendum on the adoption of the new Constitution of Kyrgyzstan's population endorsed a single candidate in the person of Roza Otunbayeva as President of the country.96

Career of Roza Otunbaeva

Roza Otunbaeva began her political career as the Communist Party’s second secretary of the Lenin rayon council (raykom) of Frunze (Bishkek). In late 1980s she served as the head of USSR delegation to UNESCO in Paris and later as the Soviet ambassador to Malaysia.97 By 1992, in Askar Akaev’s presidency Roza Otunbaeva was on positions of foreign minister and deputy prime minister and she held these positions until she became country’s first ambassador to the United States of America and Canada.98 She came back to her post in 1994, remaining there for 3 years. In 1998-2001, she served as the first Kyrgyz ambassador to the United Kingdom and in from 2002 till 2004 she was the deputy head of the United Nations special mission to Georgia.99

After the “Tulip Revolution” in Kyrgyz Republic in December 2007, Roza Otunbayeva was elected to Jogorku Kenesh - the parliament of Kyrgyzstan - on the candidate list of the Social Democratic Party of Kyrgyzstan. She served as the head of the parliamentary group of the opposition SDP beginning in October 2009. On April 7, 2010, Roza Otunbayeva was selected

98 Ibid
99 Ibid
by opposition leaders as head of a Kyrgyz interim government, following widespread rioting in Bishkek and the ousting of President Kurmanbek Bakiyev. Her first conversation after she came to power at that time was with Russian Prime Minister Vladimir Putin.\textsuperscript{100}

Her contribution to Kyrgyzstan is huge, and one of them is the initiative to give a social status to that people who was killed and injured during the second revolution and she actively supported the idea of involvement in decision-making of women and young people for which the country created a separate Ministry of Youth Affairs.\textsuperscript{101} By her initiative in Kyrgyz Republic was first formed the Public Supervisory Council of public television and radio, and then the Public Supervisory Council appeared in all State organs of the country. She has become a defender of the idea of civilian control. Her outstanding role was in the reform of the civil service, the introduction of the staff selection system based on competition, modernization accounting and hiring professionals. Roza Otunbayeva, made a speech on against corruption schemes in the energy and non-transparent tariff policy, first canceled inflated rates for light and heat, and then became the author of the transparency initiative of the fuel and energy complex.\textsuperscript{102}

However, Roza Otunbaeva after becoming as a transitional president responded about the work of law enforcement agencies. She has set the task for law enforcement officers to combat crime, which according to the Interior Ministry is being successfully implemented. Ex-president commented on OPG that crime has penetrated to the highest levels.\textsuperscript{103} She was against the presence in the country the gambling business. Moreover, she started to talk about the closing of casinos and gambling halls in the country that harm ordinary citizens and enrich criminals.

Cultural and educational sphere of the Kyrgyz Republic also developed to high degree, as for example as in 2011 she met with students, teachers, writers, artists, actors and other


\textsuperscript{102} Ibid

\textsuperscript{103} Ibid
intellectuals than all other politicians didn’t. Later, she signed the law on the epic “Manas” which would preserve and develop the cultural heritage and national ideology of the Kyrgyz people.

For women who make it to the top-most political position in a country as head of State – President, Prime Minister or Chancellor - their political clout in and support from their party, as well as their capabilities, would determine their ability to make a difference. Top political leadership could give a woman tremendous potential to make a difference. Roza Otunbaeva is one of the women who took the decisions and decide the fate of the country especially in such a difficult period. Only she was able to overcome gravity and adversity in terrible moments for the country. Experts and political scientists agree that Roza Otunbayeva, as a transitional president gave an opportunity to country to rest from the battles and recover from pathological political ambitions.

In November, 2011 young activists brought flowers to the White House in Bishkek by saying "Roses for Roza" and thanked her for the peaceful transfer of power, the courage to lead the country in difficult times and the development of democracy. As it was mention in Rosa Linda T. Miranda’s paper that “Women who develop their skills in political work and prove their integrity and commitment in public service are likely to have the greater ability to make a lasting difference when given the opportunity to participate in decision-making positions in public office.”

Eventually, Roza Otunbaeva is one of those women who take the responsibility to make decisions and defend the interest of the country.

---

104 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27, 2005;


106 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24-27, 2005;
Today, women in Kyrgyz Republic become very active in implementing different laws and especially in the sphere of different NGOs in the country. In the paper “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making” by Rosa Linda T. also mentioned that women tend to have better representation in “more alternative structures” particularly NGOs and grass-roots organizations which are at the periphery of the political mainstream and are often organizational attempts by the marginalized to protect their interests by accessing power through power from number – more translates to greater power.107 For now, huge number of women in Kyrgyz Republic works in NGOs, and social activity of women in the state is big due to unrestricted access to education. Women's NGOs work directly with the public and have experience of working with Governments and local authorities, is actively implementing its capacity in social mobilization, poverty.

Participation of women became a reason to incorporate gender into policies and programs of the country's main policy issues as "comprehensive development framework", and this factor makes women is led to the important decision-makings. There are many organizations which unites the interests of civil society which named as non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and the involvement of women to such organizations demonstrate women’s movement in Kyrgyz Republic. However, in Kyrgyzstan 80 % of NGOs108 in the country headed by women, which solve issues on social mobilization of the population, which considers as one of the priority areas for the sustainable development of society where NGOs play a big role.

Women leaders are able to take a direct part in making such significant public documents as the law on social and legal protection against violence in the family, and they also participated in the discussion of the law on the bases for state guarantees to safe the gender

---

107 Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24–27, 2005;

equality and for the holding of a legal tender examination of legislative acts and normative documents of the country. One of the important things is that women deputies and women leaders made a contribution to the discussion and adoption of the family code of the Kyrgyz Republic and because of their initiative it has been possible to include the “gender policy in politics and programs” in one of the main documents of the state as “the comprehensive development structure”. Moreover, such developments of women explain us that those women also able to make decisions and act on the equal footing with men, and their movements must strengthen their efforts in the promotion of their leadership skills.

Roza Otunbayeva said that the introduction of quotas was one pushes for women and for their promotion. Their effectiveness was evident in their decision-making on social and other issues. According to her, for the 2030 year for each country under the auspices of the United Nations undertakes to achieve 50% representation of women in all branches of Government, and today one of the main tasks for the women of Kyrgyzstan is to achieve 30% limit on posts at the decision-making level. Today, women sharply raised their representation in elected bodies of local governments: only one woman among the 44 akims of regions, only 13% of women among the deputies, and only 4.5 per cent of all heads of aiyl okmotu.

**Conclusion**

In the last decade the tendency of women’s participation in political sphere is increasing. From one hand it makes positive thoughts that with the presence of women certain issues on social, cultural even political issues will be solved, while from another hand it makes doubts that women should be in politics, because politics considered as a harsh, rude thus structured predominantly for male politicians. Still, practice showed us another side of women, that they have enough strength and spirit to overcome such difficulties in very harsh situations.

---


111 Ibid
Roza Otunbaeva, Kyrgyz iron woman who achieved goals in foreign policy of Kyrgyzstan and put our country on high levels by her performing at the international arenas. Her achievements showed the whole country as the most democratic country in the whole Central Asian region. It is one of the big achievements of women in politics to pay attention to the most vulnerable spheres of the society as healthcare, developing cultural and social spheres. Moreover, they achieved to solve problems by peaceful way because as it was mentioned in previous chapter that “women being nurtures would favor to use of peaceful means over force for resolving conflict that they will not only want to preserve human lives but also the natural environment”. At the same time, “women have a greater role in rearing their children in the moral values of society and hence would try to models of morality which make women far from corruption”.

In the case with that women feel defenseless especially in male dominated groups means that first of all, it attracts people to vote for them, for that party because the presence of one woman make a sense for society that party where will be men and women together will developed almost all spheres of society. In order to promote women in political sphere there should be provide certain programs and issues on developing skills and knowledge of women in order to make a stable, strong female group. As it was mentioned above that almost 80 % of women in Kyrgyzstan involved in NGOs make a sense that women can make decision makings for the society. The president of Kyrgyzstan, Almazbek Sharshenovich Atambaev started to appoint women on high and responsible sites which mean first of all its makes an image of civilized country and that women are clean and transparent in their work. Moreover, corruption plays a big role in Kyrgyzstan maybe that’s why president believes in their intellect, reflection and for their responsibilities and sense of justice rather than men. As scholar, Dahlerup claimed that “few successful women in top positions may have contributed substantially to the change in the perception of women as politicians, but at the same time the performance of a few outstanding women can contribute to the change rather than their number”. One of the big advantages for women will be to create certain laws on promoting and developing their political
rights which will help them to promote their rights further. Today, women have to increase their number in political sphere from which depend their effectiveness too. Kyrgyzstan is a first country which exercised women in power. Statistics and charts showed us that still not enough women in governmental places considering to men, maybe there is not enough an educated and qualified women for this positions, or maybe men don’t want to see females as their counterparts. Platform of political parties especially where included issues on women will get attention of the society and it will have opportunity to get more votes in the elections. Political parties should have to create programs first to solve society’s issues and women who came in male dominated group is also has to promote first program which will help her to make stable her position in the group. Later, she has to call female counterparts that are how to promote women in political sphere.

Women in political sphere of Kyrgyzstan play a key role especially nowadays. But as Roza Isakovna mentioned in her speech at her performance in the women’s forum that for 2030 year for each country under the auspices of the United Nations will undertake to achieve 50 % of women’s representation in all branches of government and for now one of the main tasks for women of Kyrgyzstan is to achieve 30 % limit on posts at the decision-making levels. Coming years for women in Kyrgyzstan should be period of flashing in political sphere, because now Kyrgyzstan needs women in governmental positions because women of the Kyrgyzstan - a serious socio-political and professional power, women's councils, committees, health, women's wings of political parties, women's professional associations and creative unions. It’s time to overcome corruption, to care about the healthcare and stop all conflicts by peaceful decision-makings.

Therefore the lack of women representation leads to wars and conflicts, where there are women there is peace, commitment and mediation. Since there is a link between political representation and economic-social status of women low level of female participation will cause the growth of patriarchal governance and increase female marginalization.
Bibliography:

Atai Altymyshev, “Women have a special place in politics and government” (“У женщин особое место в политике и власти”), noted in Erkin-Too newspaper №17-18 от 06.03.2015, page 5, last modified in March 17, 2015, http://roza.kg/2015/03/17/u-zhenschin-osoboe-mesto-v-politike-i-vlasti


CentrAsia, “Biography of Cholpon Baekova” article” who is who”, http://www.centrasia.ru/person2.php?&st=1112434893


Human rights movement “Bir Duino”, independent-public-political newspaper “Pluraslim” noted Mira Djangaracheva: “"The role of women in the development of society should be the agenda of the civilized governments”, www.anticorruption.kg , www.birduino.kg , #29,February, 2015, p.4;
Interview with Avazkan Ormonova-director of public fund “DIA”, Deputy of local kenesh; March 30,2015

Interview with Bermet Tursunkulova-vice-president of AUCA,April 7,2015


Novikova E.S. “Women in political life of Russia”, article, last modified April 25, 2015, http://www.a-z.ru/women/texts/novikovr.htm#)


Rosa Linda T. Miranda, “Impact of Women’s Participation in Decision-making “, The United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), Expert group meeting on equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes, with particular emphasis on political participation and leadership, October 24- 27,2005


Toktaim Umetalieva, Elvira Aytkulova, Alexander Solomatova “The role of the state in promoting women's rights in Kyrgyzstan”, (Chairman of the Association of NGOs and NPOs), 2-3,PDF e-book.